1				
2				
3	NOTE: CHANGES MADE BY THE COUR			
4				
5				
6				
7				
8				
9	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA, WESTERN DIVISION			
10	CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALL	ITORNIA, WESTERN DIVISION		
11	KKMB, LLC, A Nevada Limited	CASE No. 2:18-CV-05170-GW-JPR		
12	Liability Company,	CASE No. 2.16-C V-031/0-G W-JI K		
13	Plaintiff,	STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER		
14	V.	ORDER		
15	ABRAHAM MATTAR KHADER, an individual; ABE FINANCIAL	Hon. George H. Wu,		
16	SERVICES, INC., a California corporation; NOURA SHOUBASH, an	Presiding Judge Hon. Jean P. Rosenbluth,		
17	individual; NADIA SHOUBASH KORT, an individual; HANNA	Magistrate Judge		
18	BISHARA HIREZI, an individual; JASON BOUTROS, M.D., an			
19	individual; JASON K. BOUTROS M.D., INC., a California corporation;	Complaint Filed: June 11, 2018		
20	SANDRA RABADI, an individual; REEM J. RABADI, an individual; and	Trial Date: August 20, 2019		
21	DOES 1 through 20, inclusive,			
22	Defendants.			
23	AND RELATED CROSS AND THIRD PARTY CLAIMS			
24				
25				
26				
27				
28				

1. **STATEMENT OF INTENT**

A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action is likely to involve the production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

This action involves claims for fraud in connection with the acquisition and sale of life insurance policies. The Plaintiff is the purchaser of a life insurance policy written on the life of Co-Defendant, Noura Shoubash. The Defendants, including Noura Shoubash, are parties allegedly involved in the acquisition and sale of the life insurance policy purchased by Plaintiff. In order to establish their claims and defenses, the parties intend to seek discovery regarding information which the parties deem confidential, including but not limited to non-public information regarding the parties' financial information and banking information, health or medical information, information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions, or common law.

19 20

21 22

232425

27

28

26

It is anticipated that there will be depositions of the parties, their employees or agents, as well as that of third parties involved in the transactions and such persons will likely be asked to answer questions on these potentially sensitive subject areas. Because this matter will necessarily involve requests for disclosure of confidential information, a protective order is therefore necessary to avoid any prejudice or harm which would likely result if such information was disclosed in the absence of the protections set forth herein. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties believe they are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for trial, to address their handling at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

2. Definitions

- 2.1 <u>Action</u>: this pending federal lawsuit, *KKMB*, *LLC v. Abraham Khader*, *Noura Shoubash*, *et al.*, Case No. 2:18-cv-05170-GW(JPR).
- 2.2 <u>Challenging Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.
- 2.3 <u>Confidential Information or Items</u>: information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good Cause Statement. A Designating Party may designate Confidential Information or Items either CONFIDENTIAL or ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY, as follows:

- (a) <u>CONFIDENTIAL designation</u>. A Designating Party may designate material CONFIDENTIAL only if it deems that a reasonable basis exists for limiting dissemination of the material under the standards of Rule 26 and that the material contains confidential and/or proprietary commercial information that is not generally available to the public.
- (b) <u>ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY designation</u>. A Designating Party may only designate material ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY if it deems that disclosure of such material to another person or party would be injurious to the commercial interests of the designating entity under the standards of Rule 26 and that the material contains highly propriety technical or trade secret or business information so that the risk of improper use or disclosure to another party outweighs the right of that party to review such information.
 - 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel.
- 2.5 <u>Designating Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY."
- 2.6 <u>Disclosure or Discovery Material</u>: all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.
- 2.7 <u>Expert</u>: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.
- 2.8 <u>Non-Party</u>: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.
- 2.9 <u>Outside Counsel</u>: attorneys (and their support staff) who are not employees of a party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action.

- 2.10 <u>Party</u>: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors, employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel (and their support staffs).
- 2.11 <u>Producing Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material in this Action.
- 2.12 <u>Professional Vendors</u>: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.
- 2.13 <u>Protected Material</u>: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as "CONFIDENTIAL or "ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY."
- 2.14 <u>Receiving Party</u>: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing Party.

3. SCOPE

The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

4. DURATION

4.1 <u>If the Action proceeds to trial</u>: all of the information that was designated as confidential or maintained pursuant to this protective order will no longer carry such designation, unless compelling reasons supported by specific factual findings to proceed otherwise are made to the trial judge in advance of the trial. <u>See Kamakana v.</u> <u>City and County of Honolulu</u>, 447 F.3d 1172, 1180-81 (9th Cir. 2006) (distinguishing

"good cause" showing for sealing documents produced in discovery from "compelling reasons" standard when merits-related documents are part of court record). Accordingly, the terms of this protective order do not extend beyond the commencement of the trial.

4.2 If the Action does not proceed to trial: even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

5.2 <u>Manner and Timing of Designations</u>. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) and (b) below), or as otherwise

stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualify for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

(a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" or "ATTORNEYS EYES ONLY", to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix "CONFIDENTIAL" or "ATTORNEYS EYES ONLY" to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

(b) In the case of depositions and deposition transcripts, the Designating Party shall advise opposing counsel and the court reporter of the specific pages and exhibits to be maintained as Confidential Information at the deposition or within thirty (30) days after receipt of the transcript. For convenience, if a deposition transcript contains repeated references to Confidential Information which cannot conveniently be segregated from non-confidential information, the Designating Party may request that

the entire transcript be marked by the reporter as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY". Until the expiration of the 30 day period, the entire transcript shall be deemed Confidential Information absent an agreement by the parties on the record.

- (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" or "ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY." If only a portion or portions of the information warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).
- 5.3 <u>Inadvertent Failures to Designate</u>. Inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material, provided that the Designating Party promptly correct the designation after discovery of such inadvertent failure. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

- 6.1 <u>Timing of Challenges</u>. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's Scheduling Order.
- 6.2 <u>Meet and Confer</u>. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.
- 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the material in

27

28

question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 14 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

- 7.2 Disclosure of Information designated "ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY". Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated "ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" only to:
- the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel in this Action, as well as (a) employees of said Outside Counsel to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this Action;
- (b) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);
 - the court and its personnel; (c)
 - (d) court reporters and their staff;
- professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional (e) Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

(f) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

- (g) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto; and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any Confidential Information or Items unless they sign the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and
- (h) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions or appointed by the Court.
- 7.3 <u>Disclosure of Information designated "CONFIDENTIAL"</u>. Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to
 - (a) all persons listed in Section 7.2(a) (h), above; and
- (b) the officers, directors, and employees of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action.

8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" that Party must:

(a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order unless prohibited by law;

- (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and
- (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY" before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party's permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

9. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

- 9.1 The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "ATTORNEYS' EYES ONLY." Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.
- 9.2 In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party's Confidential Information or Items in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's Confidential Information or Items, then the Party shall:

- (a) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;
- (b) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and
- (c) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party, if requested.
- (d) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's Confidential Information or Items responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court provided the court so allows.

12. MISCELLANEOUS

- 12.1 <u>Right to Further Relief</u>. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.
- 12.2 <u>Right to Assert Other Objections</u>. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.
- 12.3 <u>Filing Protected Material</u>. Any Party who seeks to file with the Court Protected Materials must file such materials under seal pursuant to Local Rule 79-5. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by the court, the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless (a) otherwise instructed by the court or (b) the Designating Party gives notice within 24 hours that it intends to seek reconsideration or other relief from the Court.

13. FINAL DISPOSITION

After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return all

1	Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material and provide			
2	confirmation of the same. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes			
3	all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or			
4	capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are			
5	entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and			
6	hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits,			
7	expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if			
8	such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or			
9	constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in			
10	Section 4 (DURATION).			
11	14 Violetians			
12				
13				
14	including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.			
15	IT IS SO STIPULATED.			
16	Details January 2, 2010			
17	Dated: January 2, 2019 By: /s/ John A. Conkle			
18	John A. Conkle* CONKLE, KREMER & ENGEL, PLC			
19	Cl., 1., D. D., 1.11 (CD# 117401)			
20	Charles P. Randall (SB# 117491) CP RANDALL LAWYERS, PC			
21	Attorneys for Plaintiff KKMB, LLC			
22				
23				
24	Dated: January 2, 2019 By: /s/ Rouben Varozian Rouben Varozian			
25	BV LAW GROUP, APLC			
26	Attorneys for Defendants/Cross-Defendants, NADIA SHOUDBASH KORT and HANNA			
27	BISHARA HIREZI			
28				

2077.002\9952 -14
STIPLII ATED PROTECTIVE ORDE

1 2 3 4 5	Dated: December 27, 2018	By:	/s/ Andre Boniadi Andre Boniadi, BEITCHMAN & ZEKIAN, P.C. Attorneys for Defendants/Cross-Defendants, ABRAHAM MATTAR KHADER and ABE FINANCIAL SERVICES, INC.
6 7 8 9 10	Dated: January 2, 2019	By:	/s/ Salvatore J. Zimmitti Salvatore J. Zimmitti NELSON HARDIMAN LLP Attorneys for Defendants JASON BOUTROS, M.D. and JASON K. BOUTROS, M.D., INC.
11 12	Dated: November 30, 2018		/s/ Reem Rabadi Reem Rabadi (pro per)
13 14 15	Dated: November 30, 2018	By:	/s/ Sandra Rabadi Sandra Rabadi (pro per)
16 17	*Pursuant to Civil L.R. 5-4.3.4(a)(2)(i), the filer attests that all other signatories listed, and on whose behalf this filing is submitted, concur in the filing's content and have authorized the filing.		
18	FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT	IS S	O ORDERED.
19 20	Dated: January 10, 2019		fun hrenklutt
21 22			Honorable Jean P. Rosenbluth United States Magistrate Judge
23			
24			
25 26			
20 27			
28			
	II .		

2077.002\9952

EXHIBIT A ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

3					
4	I,[print or type full name], of [print or type				
5	full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and				
6	understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District				
7	Court for the Central District of California on June 11, 2018 in the case of KKMB, LLC				
8	v. Khader, et al. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this				
9	Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply				
10	could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly				
11	promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to				
12	this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with				
13	the provisions of this Order				
14	I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for				
15	the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this				
16	Stimulated Protective Order even if such enforcement proceedings occur after				
17	termination of this action. I hereby appoint [print or type full name] of [print or type				
18	full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in				
19	connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated				
20	Protective Order.				
21	Dated: BY:				
22	Signature				
23					
24	Printed Name				
25					
26					
27	City and State where sworn and signed				
28					
	2077.002\9952 -16 STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER				